CORRESPONDENCE NO. 6
PAGE 1 of 8

BEWLEY LASSLEBEN & MILLER, LIGIDARD OF SUPERVISORS

Established 1888

13215 E. PENN STREET, SUITE 510, WHITTIER, CALIFORNIA 90602-1797 5621128.9441 3 | P 2 2 !

JEFFREY S. BAIRD, ESQ.

CALIFORNIA STATE AND LOCAL TAX GROUP

JOSEPH A. VINATIERI JEFFREY S. BAIRD JASON C. DEMILLE KEVIN P. DUTHOY RICHARD L. DEWBERRY

July 20, 2012

Certified Mail, Return Receipt Requested

Clerk, Board of Supervisors County of Stanislaus 1010 10th Street, Suite 6500 Modesto, CA 95354

RE:

Filing Property Tax Refund Claim of Bombardier Aerospace Corporation

Fractionally Owned Aircraft Litigation

Dear Sirs:

We are the legal counsel to Bombardier Aerospace Corporation, which respectfully transmits herewith its Claim For Refund of Property Tax with respect to the indicated payment amounts and dates. As noted in the Claim, the underlying issues are presently subject to controlling litigation in the California Court of Appeal.

We request that you return a file stamped conformed copy of the Claim for Refund in the self-addressed envelope transmitted herewith. For this purpose we also enclosed a second copy of the Claim For Refund. Thank you.

Very truly yours,

BEWLEY, LASSLEBEN & MILLER

JEFFREY S. BAIRD, Direct Line: 562.907.2001 Direct Fax: 562.907.2038

e-mail: Jeffrey.Baird@bewleylaw.com

JSB:am Enclosure

Cc: Bruce Marshall

Kimba Sjogren

Joseph A. Vinatieri

J:\Bombardier (Flexjet)\Letters\Refund Claims\County Of Stanislaus.Docx

CORRESPONDENCE NO. 6
PAGE 2 of 8 293031



CLAIM FOR REFUND OF PROPERTY TAX [Protective claim – Controlling Litigation Pending See 18 CCR § 309]

TO: Board of Supervisors, County of <u>Stanislaus</u>, California (hereinafter "County).

The undersigned, Bombardier Aerospace Corporation, the claimant herein (hereinafter "Claimant"), hereby makes this claim for refund pursuant to Revenue & Taxation Code Section 5097 and requests that the Board of Supervisors make its order directing the controller of said County to refund to the claimant the following property tax and interest payments, with lawful interest thereon:

Tax Year	Payment Amount	Date Payment Mailed
2003/04	N/A	N/A
2004/05	674.74	27-Aug-09
2005/06	473.42	27-Aug-09
2006/07	100.05	27-Aug-09
2007/08	N/A	N/A
2008/09	N/A	N/A
2009/10	573.06	27-Aug-09
2010/11	439.40	23-Aug-10
2011/12	540.96	29-Aug-11

In support of said claim, the undersigned states:

- 1. Claimant is and at all times herein mentioned was a corporation with its principal place of business at 3400 Waterview Parkway, Suite 400, Richardson, TX 75080.
- 2. For each of the above fiscal years, the assessor of County assessed to Claimant certain property pursuant to Revenue & Taxation Code Section 1160-1162 ("Fractional Aircraft Assessment Statute"), namely fractionally owned aircraft of which Claimant was the fractional ownership program manager. Claimant is entitled to a refund of all of the above taxes and interest paid (the whole assessment for each tax year), together with interest thereon, on each of the grounds that:
 - a) The Fractional Aircraft Assessment Statute is illegal by virtue of its failure to sufficiently identify the aircraft being taxed;
 - b) County lacks constitutional jurisdiction to tax the aircraft under both the United States and California Constitutions because the aircraft have not been habitually situated, or otherwise established situs here;
 - c) The Claimant does not own, possess or control the aircraft such as to be subject to taxation under the Fractional Aircraft Assessment Statute, or otherwise under California's property tax statutes;

- d) The tax on the aircraft is not apportioned in the manner required by the United States and California Constitutions;
- e) The Fractional Aircraft Assessment Statute is unconstitutional in its imposition of a retroactive tax for all time periods predating its enactment on August 24, 2007;
- f) County has over valued the aircraft.
- 3. No refund of said taxes and interest, or any part thereof, has previously been made.
- 4. The legality and constitutionality of the Fractional Aircraft Assessment Statute is presently in litigation in Orange County Superior Court Case Nos. 30-2008-00110932, 30-2008-00107805, 30-2009-00303518 (Claimant's case) and 30-2009-00288116, which case is now on appeal before the Court of Appeal of the State of California, Fourth Appellate District, Div. Three as Case Nos. G044970 and G044980. Based upon the pendency of controlling litigation within the meaning of Property Tax Rule 1604(c), this claim should be held in abeyance pending final determination of litigation presently pending as California Court of Appeal Case Nos. G044970 and G044980 in the Fourth District Court of Appeal.

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct.

Dated: June 15, 2012 at Whittier, California.

Bombardier Aerospace Corporation.

J:\Bombardier (Flexiet)\CLAIM FOR REFUND OF PROPERTY TAX-Form REV 6-12-12.Docx

NOT MAILED TO LENDING AGENCIES ******

TBUN1-RTL 1.0.042

STANISLAUS COUNTY 2008 - 2009 PROPERTY TAX BILL

2/19/2009 8:10:02AM

Gordon B. Ford

Stanislaus County Tax Collector 1010 10th St, Ste 2500 Modesto, CA 95354 PH: 209 525 6388 UNSECURED TAX ROLL FOR FISCAL YEAR JULY 1, 2008 - JUNE 30, 2009

PROPERTY INFORMATION			IMPORTANT MESSAGES
ASMT NUMBER: FEE NUMBER: LOCATION:	800-081-365-000 036-023-002-000 0 AIRPORT WAY	TAX RATE AREA: 002-00	BIII date 02/18/2009 0 AIRPORT WAY TO ASSESS FRACTIONAL AIRCRAFT
ASSESSED OWNER:			Escape year: 2005
			******* SUPPLEMENTAL TAX BILLS ARE

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY WICHITA KS 67209 2008-2009

COUNTY VALUES, EXEMPTIONS AND TAXES						
PHONE #S GENERAL (209) 525 6388	VALUE DESCRIPTION PERSONAL PROPERTY	PRIOR	CURRENT 44,336	THIS BILL 44,336		
PAYMENTS (209) 525 6388 TAX RATES (209) 525 6597	NET TAXABLE VALUE			44,336		
VALUATIONS (209) 525 6461 ADDR CHGS (209) 525 6461			-			
EXEMPTIONS (209) 525 6461 PERS PROP (209) 525 6461						

VALUES	Х	TAX RATE PER \$100	1.000000

443.36

	VOTER APPROVED TAXES, FEES AND OTHER CHARGES						
PHONE #8	CODE	DESCRIPTION	ASSESSED VALUES	X	TAX RATE PER \$100	■ AGENCY TAXES	
(209) 576-4032 (209) 576-4032 (209) 576-4032	42350 • 45750 47725	MODESTO ELEM - BOND 03 MODESTO HIGH SCHOOL DIST- BOND 03 MODESTO HIGH-BOND 2001	44,336 44,336 44,336		.041000 .025400 .001400	18.18 11.26 .62	

AGENCY TAXES

30.06

AGENCY TAXES + DIRECT CHARGES + FEES

30.06

DUE BY AND DELINQUENT AFTER 3/31/2009

TOTAL TAXES \$473.42

IMPORTANT INFORMATION REGARDING THIS UNSECURED TAX BILL

THE LIEN DATE OWNER (ASSESSEE AT 12:01 AM ON JANUARY 1) IS RESPONSIBLE FOR PAYMENT OF THIS TAX BILL. THE SALE OR DISPOSAL OF PROPERTY DOES NOT RELIEVE THE ASSESSEE OF THE OBLIGATION TO PAY TAXES.

IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID AT 5:00 PM ON THE DUE DATE, A 10% PENALTY ATTACHES. IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID TWO MONTHS AFTER THE DUE DATE, AN ADDITIONAL 1.5% PENALTY ATTACHES ON THE FIRST OF EACH MONTH UNTIL THE TAXES ARE PAID IN FULL.

TO ENFORCE PAYMENT, THE LAW ALLOWS THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURSUE COLLECTION ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES. THIS MAY INCLUDE THE FILING OF A CERTIFICATE OF LIEN OR THE SEIZURE AND SALE OF PERSONAL PROPERTY, IMPROVEMENTS OR POSSESSORY INTEREST OF THE ASSESSEE.

TBUN1-RTL 1.0.042

STANISLAUS COUNTY 2008 - 2009 PROPERTY TAX BILL Gordon B. Ford

2/19/2009

8:10:02AM

Stanislaus County Tax Collector 1010 10th St, Ste 2500 Modesto, CA 95354 PH: 209 525 6388 UNSECURED TAX ROLL FOR FISCAL YEAR JULY 1, 2008 - JUNE 30, 2009

PROPERTY INFORMATION			IMPORTANT MESSAGES
FEE NUMBER: 036-023	11-365-000 TAX RATE AREA: 23-002-000 PORT WAY	002-001	BIII date 02/18/2009 0 AIRPORT WAY TO ASSESS FRACTIONAL AIRCRAFT Escape year: 2006

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY WICHITA KS 67209

NOT MAILED TO LENDING AGENCIES

COUNTY VALUES, EXEMPTIONS AND TAXES						
PHONE #S	VALUE DESCRIPTION	PRIOR	CURRENT	THIS BILL		
GENERAL (209) 525 6388	PERSONAL PROPERTY		9,242	9,242		
PAYMENTS (209) 525 6388	NET TAXABLE VALUE			9.242		
TAX RATES (209) 525 6597	HET TAMBLE VALUE			3,242		
VALUATIONS (209) 525 6461						
ADDR CHGS (209) 525 6461						
EXEMPTIONS (209) 525 6461						
PERS PROP (209) 525 6461						

VALUES X TAX RATE PER \$100 1.000000

92.42

}	VOTER APPROVED TAXES, FEES AND OTHER CHARGES							
PHONE #S	CODE	DESCRIPTION	ASSESSED VALUES	Х	TAX RATE PER \$100		AGENCY TAXES	
(209) 576-4032 (209) 576-4032 (209) 576-4032	42350 45750 47725	MODESTO ELEM - BOND 03 MODESTO HIGH SCHOOL DIST- BOND 03 MODESTO HIGH-BOND 2001	9,242 9,242 9,242		.038841 .024719 .001100		3.59 2.28 .10	
(209) 575-6959	47800	YCCD - BOND 2005 A	9,242		.017996		1.66	

AGENCY TAXES

7.63

AGENCY TAXES + DIRECT CHARGES + FEES

DUE BY AND DELINQUENT AFTER 3/31/2009

TOTAL TAXES \$100.05

IMPORTANT INFORMATION REGARDING THIS UNSECURED TAX BILL

THE LIEN DATE OWNER (ASSESSEE AT 12:01 AM ON JANUARY 1) IS RESPONSIBLE FOR PAYMENT OF THIS TAX BILL. THE SALE OR DISPOSAL OF PROPERTY DOES NOT RELIEVE THE ASSESSEE OF THE OBLIGATION TO PAY TAXES.

IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID AT 5:00 PM ON THE DUE DATE, A 10% PENALTY ATTACHES. IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID TWO MONTHS AFTER THE DUE DATE, AN ADDITIONAL 1.5% PENALTY ATTACHES ON THE FIRST OF EACH MONTH UNTIL THE TAXES ARE PAID IN FULL.

TO ENFORCE PAYMENT, THE LAW ALLOWS THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURSUE COLLECTION ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES. THIS MAY INCLUDE THE FILING OF A CERTIFICATE OF LIEN OR THE SEIZURE AND SALE OF PERSONAL PROPERTY, IMPROVEMENTS OR POSSESSORY INTEREST OF THE ASSESSEE.

TBUN1-RTL 1.0.042

EXEMPTIONS (209) 525 6461 PERS PROP (209) 525 6461

STANISLAUS COUNTY 2008 - 2009 PROPERTY TAX BILL

2/19/2009 8:10:02AM

Gordon B. Ford

Stanislaus County Tax Collector 1010 10th St, Ste 2500 Modesto, CA 95354 PH: 209 525 6388 UNSECURED TAX ROLL FOR FISCAL YEAR JULY 1, 2008 - JUNE 30, 2009

PROPERTY INFORMATION IMPORTANT MESSAGES ASMT NUMBER: 800-081-365-000 TAX RATE AREA: 002-001 Bill date 02/18/2009 **0 AIRPORT WAY** FEE NUMBER: 036-023-002-000 LOCATION: **0 AIRPORT WAY** TO ASSESS FRACTIONAL AIRCRAFT ASSESSED OWNER: Escape year: 2004 **** SUPPLEMENTAL TAX BILLS ARE NOT MAILED TO LENDING AGENCIES ******

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY WICHITA KS 67209 2008-2009

COUNTY VALUES, EXEMPTIONS AND TAXES							
PHONE #S	VALUE DESCRIPTION	PRIOR	CURRENT	THIS BILL			
GENERAL (209) 525 6388	PERSONAL PROPERTY		62,580	62,580			
PAYMENTS (209) 525 6388	NET TAXABLE VALUE			62,580			
TAX RATES (209) 525 6597	HET TANABLE WIEGE			02,000			
VALUATIONS (209) 525 6461							
ADDR CHG\$ (209) 525 6461							

VALUES X TAX RATE PER \$100 1.000000

625.80

1	VOTER APPROVED TAXES, FEES AND OTHER CHARGES					
PHONE #S	CODE	DESCRIPTION	ASSESSED VALUES	X	TAX RATE PER \$100	■ AGENCY TAXES
(209) 576-4032 (209) 576-4032	42350 45750	MODESTO ELEM - BOND 03 MODESTO HIGH SCHOOL DIST- BOND 03	62,580 62,580		.049100 .029100	30.73 18.21

AGENCY TAXES

48.94

AGENCY TAXES + DIRECT CHARGES + FEES

48 94

DUE BY AND DELINQUENT AFTER 3/31/2009

TOTAL TAXES \$674.74

IMPORTANT INFORMATION REGARDING THIS UNSECURED TAX BILL

THE LIEN DATE OWNER (ASSESSEE AT 12:01 AM ON JANUARY 1) IS RESPONSIBLE FOR PAYMENT OF THIS TAX BILL. THE SALE OR DISPOSAL OF PROPERTY DOES NOT RELIEVE THE ASSESSEE OF THE OBLIGATION TO PAY TAXES.

IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID AT 5:00 PM ON THE DUE DATE, A 10% PENALTY ATTACHES. IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID TWO MONTHS AFTER THE DUE DATE, AN ADDITIONAL 1.5% PENALTY ATTACHES ON THE FIRST OF EACH MONTH UNTIL THE TAXES ARE PAID IN FULL.

TO ENFORCE PAYMENT, THE LAW ALLOWS THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURSUE COLLECTION ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES. THIS MAY INCLUDE THE FILING OF A CERTIFICATE OF LIEN OR THE SEIZURE AND SALE OF PERSONAL PROPERTY, IMPROVEMENTS OR POSSESSORY INTEREST OF THE ASSESSEE.

1 0.021

STAIRISLAUS COUNTY 2010 - 2011 PROPERTY TAX BILL

7/14/2010 1:13:48PM

3.042

Gordon B. Ford, Stanislaus County Tax Collector

1010 Tenth Street, Suite 2500 Modesto, CA 95354 PH: 209-525-6388 LOBBY HOURS: 8:30 AM - 4:30 PM

UNSECURED TAX ROLL FOR FISCAL YEAR JULY 1, 2010 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2011

PROPERTY INFORMATION IMPORTANT MESSAGES ASMT NUMBER 800-081-365-000 TAX RATE AREA: 002-001 Bill date 07/08/2010 FEE NUMBER 036-023-002-000 ACRES 0 AIRPORT WAY LOCATION: O AIRPORT WAY ASSESSED OWNER BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP ATTN: TAX DEPT

ONE LEARJET WAY WICHITA KS 67209

COUNTY VALUES, EXEMPTIONS AND TAXES

PHONE #9 GENERAL (209) 525 6388 PAYMENTS (209) 525 8388 VALUE DESCRIPTION

ASSESSED VALUES TAX RATE /100 = COUNTY TAXES

TAX RATES (209) 525 6597 VALUATIONS (209) 525 6461 ADOR CHGS (209) 525 6461 EXEMPTIONS (209) 525 6461

PERS PROP (209) 525 6461

PERSONAL PROPERTY

41,020

NET TAXABLE VALUE 41,020 1.000000 410.20 VOTER APPROVED TAXES, TAXING AGENCY DIRECT CHARGES AND SPECIAL ASSESSMENTS PHONE #3 CODE DESCRIPTION ASSESSED VALUES TAX RATE /100 = (209) 576-4032 42340 MODESTO ELEM - BOND 2001 41,020 0.023438 9.61 47725 MODESTO HIGH-BOND 2001 41,020 0.027609 (209) 576-4032 11.33 (209) 575-6959 47800 YCCD - BOND 2005 A 41,020 0.007565 3 10 (209) 575-6959 47860 YCCD - BOND 2007 C 41,020 0.012587 5.16

29.20

DUE BY AND DELINQUENT AFTER 08/31/2010

TOTAL TAXES 439.40

IMPORTANT INFORMATION REGARDING THIS UNSECURED TAX BILL

THE LIEN DATE OWNER (ASSESSEE AT 12:01 AM ON JANUARY 1) IS RESPONSIBLE FOR PAYMENT OF THIS TAX BILL. THE SALE OR DISPOSAL OF PROPERTY DOES NOT RELIEVE THE ASSESSEE OF THE OBLIGATION TO PAY TAXES.

IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID AT 5:00 PM ON THE DUE DATE, A 10% PENALTY ATTACHES. IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID TWO MONTHS AFTER THE DUE DATE, AN ADDITIONAL 1.5% PENALTY ATTACHES ON THE FIRST OF EACH MONTH UNTIL THE TAXES ARE PAID IN FULL.

TO ENFORCE PAYMENT, THE LAW ALLOWS THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURSUE COLLECTION ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES. THIS MAY INCLUDE THE FILING OF A CERTIFICATE OF LIEN OR THE SEIZURE AND SALE OF PERSONAL PROPERTY, IMPROVEMENTS OR POSSESSORY INTEREST OF THE ASSESSEE.

STANISLAUS COUNTY UNSECURED PROPERTY TAXES - PAYMENT STUB

ASMT NUMBER: FEE NUMBER:

CURRENT OWNER:

LOCATION:

800-081-365-000 036-023-002-000 **Q AIRPORT WAY**

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP

ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY WICHITA KS 67209

MAKE CHECK PAYABLE TO: Gordon B. Ford, Stanislaus County Tax Collector

P O Box 859

Modesto CA 95353 Phone No. (209) 525 6388

IF PAID BY 08/31/2010

439.40

DELINQUENT AFTER 08/31/2010 (INCLUDES PENALTY OF 43.94)

WTBUA 872

STAMSLAUS COUNTY 2011 - 2012 PROPERTY TAX BILL

7/15/2011 10:09:38AM

2.4.005

Gordon B. Ford, Stanislaus County Tax Collector

1010 10th St. Ste 2500 Modesto, CA 95354 Ph:209-525-6388

UNSECURED TAX ROLL FOR FISCAL YEAR JULY 1, 2011 THROUGH JUNE 30, 2012

PROPERTY INFORMATION - TAX YEAR: 2011 ASMT NUMBER: 800-081-365-000

TAX RATE AREA: 002-001 036-023-002-000 ACRES:

Bill date 07/14/2011

FEE NUMBER: LOCATION: ASSESSED OWNER:

0 AIRPORT WAY BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP

0 AIRPORT WAY

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP

ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY **WICHITA KS 67209**

2011-2012

IMPORTANT MESSAGES

COUNTY VALUES, EXEMPTIONS AND TAXES

PHONE #S

VALUE DESCRIPTION

ASSESSED VALUES X TAX RATE /100

COUNTY TAXES

GENERAL (209) 525 6388 PAYMENTS (209) 525 6388 TAX RATES (209) 525 6597 VALUATIONS (209) 525 6461

ADDR CHGS (209) 525 6461 EXEMPTIONS (209) 525 6461 PERS PROP (209) 525 6461

PERSONAL PROPERTY

49 860

NET TAXABLE VALUE

49 860

1.000000

498.60

VOTER APPROVED TAXES, TAXING AGENCY DIRECT CHARGES AND SPECIAL ASSESSMENTS								
PHONE #8	CODE	DESCRIPTION	ASSESSED VALUES	Х	TAX RATE /100	=	AGENCY TAXES	
209 575-6959	47860	YCCD - BOND 2007 C	49,880		0.014925		7.44	
575-6959	47870	YCCD - BOND 2010 D	49,860		0.000313		.16	
(209) 578-4032	42340	MODESTO ELEM - BOND 2001	49,860		0.027105		13.51	
(209) 576-4032	47725	MODESTO HIGH-BOND 2001	49,860		0.031904		15.91	
(209) 575-6959	47800	YCCD - BOND 2005 A	49,860		0.010714		5 34	

42.36

DUE BY AND DELINQUENT AFTER 08/31/2011

TOTAL TAXES 540.96

IMPORTANT INFORMATION REGARDING THIS UNSECURED TAX BILL

THE LIEN DATE OWNER (ASSESSEE AT 12:01 AM ON JANUARY 1) IS RESPONSIBLE FOR PAYMENT OF THIS TAX BILL. THE SALE OR DISPOSAL OF PROPERTY DOES NOT RELIEVE THE ASSESSEE OF THE OBLIGATION TO PAY TAXES.

IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID AT 5:00 PM ON THE DUE DATE, A 10% PENALTY ATTACHES. IF THE TAXES REMAIN UNPAID TWO MONTHS AFTER THE DUE DATE, AN ADDITIONAL 1.5% PENALTY ATTACHES ON THE FIRST OF EACH MONTH UNTIL THE TAXES ARE PAID IN FULL.

TO ENFORCE PAYMENT, THE LAW ALLOWS THE TAX COLLECTOR TO PURSUE COLLECTION ENFORCEMENT ACTIVITIES. THIS MAY INCLUDE THE FILING OF A CERTIFICATE OF LIEN OR THE SEIZURE AND SALE OF PERSONAL PROPERTY, IMPROVEMENTS OR POSSESSORY INTEREST OF THE ASSESSEE.

STANISLAUS COUNTY UNSECURED PROPERTY TAXES - PAYMENT STUB

ASMT NUMBER:

800-081-365-000

MAKE CHECK PAYABLE TO:

FEE NUMBER: LOCATION:

036-023-002-000 **0 AIRPORT WAY** Gordon B. Ford, Stanislaus County Tax Collector P O Box 859

CURRENT OWNER:

BOMBARDIER AEROSPACE CORP

Modesto CA 95353 Phone No. (209) 525 6388

ATTN: TAX DEPT ONE LEARJET WAY

WICHITA KS 67209

2011-2012

IF PAID BY 08/31/2011

540.96

DELINQUENT AFTER 08/31/2011 (INCLUDES PENALTY OF 54.09)

595.05